

Consideration of Comments

Project Name: 2017-02 Modifications to Personnel Performance, Training, and Qualification Standards

Comment Period Start Date: 6/21/2017

Comment Period End Date: 7/24/2017

There were 29 sets of responses, including comments from approximately 115 different people from approximately 85 companies representing all 10 of the Industry Segments as shown in the table on the following pages.

All comments submitted can be reviewed in their original format on the project page.

If you feel that your comment has been overlooked, please let us know immediately. Our goal is to give every comment serious consideration in this process. If you feel there has been an error or omission, you can contact the Director of Standards Development, Steve Noess (via email) or at (404) 446-9691.



Questions

- 1. The PRT is recommending that a clarifying footnote be added to all of the requirements in PER-003-1. The PRT is suggesting that the footnote state the following: "The certifications referenced under the standard are those under the NERC System Operator Certification Program." Do you agree that this footnote would provide the necessary clarity? If not, please explain in the comment area below.
- 2. The PRT suggests that PER-004-2 be retired based on the identified duplicate requirements. Do you agree that his standard should be retired? If not, please explain in the comment area below.
- 3. <u>Do you know of any additional requirements that the PRT has not identified to justify the retirement of PER-004-2? If yes, please</u> identify the standard and requirement in the comment area below.

The Industry Segments are:

- 1 Transmission Owners
- 2 RTOs, ISOs
- 3 Load-serving Entities
- 4 Transmission-dependent Utilities
- 5 Electric Generators
- 6 Electricity Brokers, Aggregators, and Marketers
- 7 Large Electricity End Users
- 8 Small Electricity End Users
- 9 Federal, State, Provincial Regulatory or other Government Entities
- 10 Regional Reliability Organizations, Regional Entities



| Organization Name | Name | Segment(s) | Region | Group Name | Group Member Name | Group Member Organization | Group Member Segment(s) | Group Member Region |
|----------------------|--------------------|------------|------------------------|------------------------------------|---|--|-------------------------------|------------------------|
| | Brian Van Gheem | 6 | NA - Not Applicable | ACES Standards Collaborators | Greg Froehling | Rayburn Country Electric Cooperative, Inc. | 3 | SPP RE |
| | | | | Bob Solomon | Hoosier Energy Rural Electric Cooperative, Inc. | 1 | RF | |
| | | | | | Karl Kohlrus | Prairie Power, Inc. | 1,3 | SERC |
| | | | | | Steve McElhaney | Cooperative Energy | 4,6 | SERC |
| | | | I | Bill Hutchison | Southern Illinois Power Cooperative | 1 | SERC | |
| | | | | | Amber Skillern | East Kentucky Power Cooperative | 1,3 | SERC |
| | | | | | Tara Lightner | Sunflower Electric Power Corporation | 1 | SPP RE |



| Organization Name | Name | Segment(s) | Region | Group Name | Group Member Name | Group Member Organization | Group Member Segment(s) | Group Member Region |
|----------------------------|-----------------|--------------|--------------|-------------|----------------------|--|-------------------------------|------------------------|
| | | | | | Shari Heino | Brazos Electric Power Cooperative, Inc. | 1,5 | Texas RE |
| | | | | | John Shaver | "Arizona Electric Power Cooperative, Inc. " | 1 | WECC |
| Duke Energy Colby Bellvill | Colby Bellville | ille 1,3,5,6 | FRCC,RF,SERC | Duke Energy | Doug Hils | Duke Energy | 1 | RF |
| | | | | | Lee Schuster | Duke Energy | 3 | FRCC |
| | | | | | Dale Goodwine | Duke Energy | 5 | SERC |
| | | | | | Greg Cecil | Duke Energy | 6 | RF |
| Midwest Reliability | Dana Klem | 1,2,3,4,5,6 | MRO | MRO NSRF | Joseph DePoorter | Madison Gas & Electric | 3,4,5,6 | MRO |
| Organization | | | | | Larry Heckert | Alliant Energy | 4 | MRO |
| | | | | | Amy Casucelli | Xcel Energy | 1,3,5,6 | MRO |
| | | | | | Michael Brytowski | Great River Energy | 1,3,5,6 | MRO |
| | | | | | Jodi Jensen | Western Area Power Administration | 1,6 | MRO |



| Organization Name | Name | Segment(s) | Region | Group Name | Group Member Name | Group Member Organization | Group Member Segment(s) | Group Member Region |
|-----------------------|--------------------|------------|--------|------------|-----------------------|--|-------------------------------|------------------------|
| | | | | | Kayleigh Wilkerson | Lincoln Electric System | 1,3,5,6 | MRO |
| | | | | | Mahmood Safi | Omaha Public Power District | 1,3,5,6 | MRO |
| | | | | | Brad Parret | Minnesota Powert | 1,5 | MRO |
| | | | | | Terry Harbour | MidAmerican Energy Company | 1,3 | MRO |
| | | | | | Tom Breene | Wisconsin Public Service Corporation | 3,5,6 | MRO |
| | | | | | Jeremy Voll | Basin Electric Power Cooperative | 1 | MRO |
| | | | | | Kevin Lyons | Central Iowa Power Cooperative | 1 | MRO |
| | | | | | Mike Morrow | Midcontinent ISO | 2 | MRO |
| Seattle City Light | Ginette Lacasse | 1,3,4,5,6 | WECC | | Pawel Krupa | Seattle City Light | 1 | WECC |



| Organization Name | Name | Segment(s) | Region | Group Name | Group Member Name | Group Member Organization | Group Member Segment(s) | Group Member Region |
|-------------------------|-------------------|------------------------------|------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------|
| | | | | Seattle City Light Ballot | Hao Li | Seattle City Light | 4 | WECC |
| | | | | Body | Bud (Charles) Freeman | Seattle City Light | 6 | WECC |
| | | | | N F | Mike Haynes | Seattle City Light | 5 | WECC |
| | | | | | Michael Watkins | Seattle City Light | 1,4 | WECC |
| | | | | | Faz Kasraie | Seattle City Light | 5 | WECC |
| | | | | | John Clark | Seattle City Light | 6 | WECC |
| | | | | | Tuan Tran | Seattle City Light | 3 | WECC |
| | | | | | Laurrie Hammack | Seattle City Light | 3 | WECC |
| DTE Energy - Detroit | Detroit Edison | DTE Energy - DTE Electric | Jeffrey Depriest | DTE Energy - DTE Electric | 5 | RF | | |
| Edison Company | | | | Daniel Herring | DTE Energy - DTE Electric | 4 | RF | |
| | | | | | Karie Barczak | DTE Energy - DTE Electric | 3 | RF |



| Organization Name | Name | Segment(s) | Region | Group Name | Group Member Name | Group Member Organization | Group Member Segment(s) | Group Member Region |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|------------|--------|----------------------------------|-----------------------------|--|-------------------------------|------------------------|
| Southern Company - Southern | ompany - Morgan outhern ompany | 1,3,5,6 | SERC | Southern Company | Katherine Prewitt | Southern Company Services, Inc | 1 | SERC |
| Company Services, Inc. | | | | | Jennifer Sykes | Southern Company Generation and Energy Marketing | 6 | SERC |
| | | | | R Scott Moore | Alabama Power Company | 3 | SERC | |
| | | | | | William Shultz | Southern Company Generation | 5 | SERC |
| California ISO | Richard Vine | 2 | | ISO/RTO | Ali Miremadi | California ISO | 2 | WECC |
| | | | | Council | Greg Campoli | NYISO | 2 | NPCC |
| | | | | Standards Review Committee | Kathleen Goodman | ISONE | 2 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Nathan Bigbee | ERCOT | 2 | Texas RE |
| | | | | | Terry Bilke | MISO | 2 | MRO |
| | | | | | Ben Li | IESO | 2 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Al DiCaprio | PJM | 2 | RF |
| | | | | | Charles Yeung | SPP | 2 | SPP RE |



| Organization Name | Name | Segment(s) | Region | Group Name | Group Member Name | Group Member Organization | Group Member Segment(s) | Group Member Region |
|----------------------------------|-------------|----------------------|--------------------|---|---|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------|
| Northeast | Ruida Shu | 1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10 | NPCC | RSC | Paul Malozewski | Hydro One. | 1 | NPCC |
| Power Coordinating Council | pordinating | | | Guy Zito | Northeast Power Coordinating Council | NA - Not Applicable | NPCC | |
| | | | Randy MacDonald | New Brunswick Power | 2 | NPCC | | |
| | | | | Wayne Sipperly | New York Power Authority | 4 | NPCC | |
| | | | | | Glen Smith | Entergy Services | 4 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Brian Robinson | Utility Services | 5 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Bruce Metruck | New York Power Authority | 6 | NPCC |
| | | | Alan Adamson | New York State Reliability Council | 7 | NPCC | | |
| | | | | | Edward Bedder | Orange & Rockland Utilities | 1 | NPCC |



| Organization Name | Name | Segment(s) | Region | Group Name | Group Member Name | Group Member Organization | Group Member Segment(s) | Group Member Region |
|----------------------|------|------------|--------|------------|----------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------|
| | | | | | David Burke | Orange & Rockland Utilities | 3 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Michele Tondalo | UI | 1 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Sylvain Clermont | Hydro Quebec | 1 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Si Truc Phan | Hydro Quebec | 2 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Helen Lainis | IESO | 2 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Laura Mcleod | NB Power | 1 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Michael Forte | Con Edison | 1 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Kelly Silver | Con Edison | 3 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Peter Yost | Con Edison | 4 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Brian O'Boyle | Con Edison | 5 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Michael Schiavone | National Grid | 1 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Michael Jones | National Grid | 3 | NPCC |
| | | | | | David Ramkalawan | Ontario Power Generation Inc. | 5 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Quintin Lee | Eversource Energy | 1 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Kathleen Goodman | ISO-NE | 2 | NPCC |



| Organization Name | Name | Segment(s) | Region | Group Name | Group Member Name | Group Member Organization | Group Member Segment(s) | Group Member Region |
|----------------------|--------------------|------------|--------|------------------------------|----------------------|---|-------------------------------|------------------------|
| | | | | | Greg Campoli | NYISO | 2 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Silvia Mitchell | NextEra Energy - Florida Power and Light Co. | 6 | NPCC |
| | | | | | Sean Bodkin | Dominion - Dominion Resources, Inc. | 6 | NPCC |
| | Shannon Mickens | | SPP RE | Standards Review Group | Shannon Mickens | Southwest Power Pool Inc. | 2 | SPP RE |
| | | | | | Lonnie Lindekugel | Southwest Power Pool Inc. | 2 | SPP RE |
| | | | | | James Nail | City of Independence Power and Light | 3 | SPP RE |
| | | | | | John Allen | City Utilities of Springfield, Missouri | 4 | SPP RE |
| | | | | | Kevin Giles | Westar Energy | 1 | SPP RE |



| Organization Name | Name | Segment(s) | Region | Group Name | Group Member Name | Group Member Organization | Group Member Segment(s) | Group Member Region |
|----------------------|------|------------|--------|------------|----------------------|---|-------------------------------|------------------------|
| | | | | | Michelle Corley | Cleco Corporation | 3 | SPP RE |
| | | | | | Mike Kidwell | Empire District Electric Company | 1,3,5 | SPP RE |
| | | | | | Robert Gray | Board of Public Utilities (Kansas City,KS-BPU) | NA - Not Applicable | SPP RE |
| | | | | | Brian Wood | Southwest Power Pool Inc. | 2 | SPP RE |



| 1. The PRT is recommending that a clarifying footnote be added to all of the requirements in PER-003-1. The PRT is suggesting that the |
|--|
| footnote state the following: "The certifications referenced under the standard are those under the NERC System Operator Certification |
| Program." Do you agree that this footnote would provide the necessary clarity? If not, please explain in the comment area below. |

Thomas Foltz - AEP - 3.5

| Answer | No |
|---------------|----|
| Document Name | |

Comment

As stated in our previous comments related to Project 2016-EPR-01, AEP believes the standard as currently written is sufficiently clear in this regard. The current version of the standard states that its purpose is "to ensure that System Operators performing the reliability-related tasks of the Reliability Coordinator, Balancing Authority and Transmission Operator are certified through the NERC System Operator Certification Program when filling a Real-time operating position responsible for control of the Bulk Electric System." This, coupled with the references to "NERC Reliability Operator certificate" within the requirements themselves, provides a clear and direct correlation to the certification specified within the NERC System Operator Certification Program Manual. As a result, we see no lack of clarity within the standard. While AEP does not entirely object to the concept of explicitly referencing the SOC Program Manual in the requirements of PER-003-1, extreme care should taken to ensure that additional obligations aren't unintentionally implied by generally referring to the entire manual as a whole.

| Likes 0 | |
|------------|--|
| Dislikes 0 | |

Response

Industry response and feedback received from this posting and the PRT recommendation posting reaffirms the recommendation to add a footnote to provide clarity as to the connection between the Standard and the NERC System Operator Certification Program Manual.



The intent of the SAR DT is not to expand the standard to reflect anything more than the certifications referenced in the NERC System Operator Certification Program Manual not the manual in its entirety.

Michael Cruz-Montes - CenterPoint Energy Houston Electric, LLC - 1 - Texas RE

| Answer | No |
|---------------|----|
| Document Name | |

Comment

CenterPoint Energy does not believe any clarification is needed. The Purpose states, "To ensure that System Operators performing the reliability-related tasks of the Reliability Coordinator, Balancing Authority and Transmission Operator are certified through the NERC System Operator Certification Program when filling a Real-time operating position responsible for control of the Bulk Electric System." No revisions are warranted.

| Likes 0 | |
|------------|--|
| Dislikes 0 | |

Response

Industry response and feedback received from this posting and the PRT recommendation posting reaffirms the recommendation to add a footnote to provide clarity as to the connection between the Standard and the NERC System Operator Certification Program Manual.

Brian Van Gheem - ACES Power Marketing - 6 - NA - Not Applicable, Group Name ACES Standards Collaborators

| Answer | No |
|---------------|----|
| Document Name | |

Comment

1. The language listed within this question does not currently align with what is listed within the SAR. We want to confirm that the language proposed does not identify a specific standard revision (i.e. PER-003-1). Furthermore, we propose the footnote references the NERC Personnel Certification Program, as identified within the NERC Rules of Procedure. We propose using this language instead for the footnote, "The NERC certificates referenced in this standard pertain to those identified under the NERC Personnel Certification Program (i.e. NERC System Operator Certification Program)."



| 2. | We feel the SDT has misunderstood our previous comments regarding the Enhanced Periodic Review of the PER Reliability |
|----|---|
| | Standards. The scope of PER-003 is to require registered entities to staff Real-time operating positions with NERC-certified System |
| | Operators performing reliability-related tasks. Personnel are certified through an examination process that is dictated by the |
| | NERC System Operator Certification Program and governed by the NERC Personnel Certification Governance Committee |
| | (PCGC). However, with recent changes to the exam, as identified on the NERC web site |
| | (http://www.nerc.com/pa/Train/SysOpCert/Pages/default.aspx), we no longer see a one-to-one set of minimum competencies |
| | necessary for eligible candidates to possess in order to take the NERC System Operator Certification exam. This places a |
| | compliance burden on applicable entities to demonstrate a reasonable assurance that their NERC-certified System Operators have |
| | obtained the necessary competencies, as identified within the PER-003-1 standard. We feel this "chicken-and-egg" problem could |
| | be entirely avoided by removing the minimum set of competencies from the standard and only requiring applicable entities to |
| | staff Real-time operating positions with NERC-certified System Operators performing reliability-related tasks. This would also |
| | provide the NERC PCGC more control over the NERC System Operator Certification Program and not conflict with examination and |
| | continuing education requirements posted on the NERC web site. |

| We thank you for this opportunity to provide these com |
|--|
|--|

| Likes 0 | |
|------------|--|
| Dislikes 0 | |

Response

- 1. Thank you for your comment. The language referenced is suggested language provided by the SAR DT. The actual language will be developed by the standard drafting team during the next phase of this project.
- 2. The SAR DT does not know of any violations of this standard that nessitates the modifications you suggested related to competencies associated with perceived compliance burden. FERC Order 693 paragraph 1396 directed the ERO to include minimum competencies in this standard. Therefore, the scope of the standard is the minimum competencies required to operate the BES as a NERC Certified System Operator (NCSO).

| Aaron Cavanaugh - Bonneville Power | Administration - 1,3,5,6 - WECC |
|------------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Answer | Yes |
| Document Name | |



| Comment | | |
|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| No comment. | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Daniel Grinkevich - Con Ed - Consolidat | ed Edison Co. of New York - 1,3,5,6 | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| The footnote provides necessary clarity. | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Leonard Kula - Independent Electricity System Operator - 2 | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |



| We agree that the proposed footnote will provide the necessary clarification, but suggest to change "certifications" to certificates" to conform with the language used in the requirements. | | |
|--|---|--|
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| Thank you for your comment. The language referenced is suggested language provided by the SAR DT. The actual language will be developed by the standard drafting team during the next phase of this project. | | |
| Ginette Lacasse - Seattle City Light - 1,3 | 3,4,5,6 - WECC, Group Name Seattle City Light Ballot Body | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| No Comments | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Richard Vine - California ISO - 2, Group Name ISO/RTO Council Standards Review Committee | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |



| No comment | | |
|---|---|--|
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Jamie Monette - Allete - Minnesota Po | wer, Inc 1 | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Alex Ybarra - Public Utility District No. | 2 of Grant County, Washington - 1,4,5,6 | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |



| LeRoy Patterson - Public Utility District No. 2 of Grant County, Washington - 1,4,5,6 | | |
|---|--|--|
| Answer Yes | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| ty of Tallahassee, FL) - 1,3,5 | | |
| Yes | | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Kristine Ward - Seminole Electric Cooperative, Inc 1,3,4,5,6 - FRCC | | |
| Yes | | |
| | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |



| Likes 0 | |
|--------------------------------------|--|
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| Lauren Price - American Transmission | Company, LLC - 1 |
| Answer | Yes |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| Marsha Morgan - Southern Company - | - Southern Company Services, Inc 1,3,5,6 - SERC, Group Name Southern Company |
| Answer | Yes |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| | |



| Laura Nelson - IDACORP - Idaho Power Company - 1 | |
|---|-----|
| Answer | Yes |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| Amy Casuscelli - Xcel Energy, Inc 1,3,5,6 - MRO,WECC,SPP RE | |
| Answer | Yes |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| sean erickson - Western Area Power Administration - 1,6 | |
| Answer | Yes |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| | |



| Likes 0 | | |
|---|-----|--|
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Dana Klem - Midwest Reliability Organization - 1,2,3,4,5,6 - MRO, Group Name MRO NSRF | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Michelle Amarantos - APS - Arizona Public Service Co 1,3,5,6 | | |



| Answer | Yes | |
|---|-----|--|
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Karie Barczak - DTE Energy - Detroit Edison Company - 3,4,5, Group Name DTE Energy - DTE Electric | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Rachel Coyne - Texas Reliability Entity, Inc 10 | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| | | |



| Dislikes 0 | | |
|--|--------------------------------------|--|
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Colby Bellville - Duke Energy - 1,3,5,6 - | FRCC,SERC,RF, Group Name Duke Energy | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Stephanie Burns - International Transmission Company Holdings Corporation - 1 - MRO,SPP RE,RF | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Ruida Shu - Northeast Power Coordinating Council - 1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10 - NPCC, Group Name RSC | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| | | |



| Document Name | | |
|---|---|--|
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Shannon Mickens - Southwest Power P | ool, Inc. (RTO) - 2 - SPP RE, Group Name SPP Standards Review Group | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| John Merrell - Tacoma Public Utilities (Tacoma, WA) - 1,3,4,5,6 | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |



| Response | | |
|--|-------------------------|--|
| | | |
| Elizabeth Axson - Electric Reliability | Council of Texas, Inc 2 | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| | | |

2. The PRT suggests that PER-004-2 be retired based on the identified duplicate requirements. Do you agree that his standard should be retired? If not, please explain in the comment area below.

Rachel Coyne - Texas Reliability Entity, Inc. - 10

| Answer | Nc |
|----------------------|----|
| Document Name | |

Comment

Texas RE is concerned there could be a potential reliability gap in retiring PER-004-2 R1. The SAR argues PER-004-2 is duplicative and all requirements are covered in other reliability standards. Texas RE is concerned that without an explicit requirement to be staffed with NERC-certified operators 24/7 the RCs' control centers may not be staffed with adequately trained personnel. Is the SDT's position that



| without the explicit obligation in PER-004-2 R1 that there would be a continuing explicit obligation for RCs to be staffed with NERC-certified operators 24/7? If so, please explain and indicate the specific standard requirements including such compliance responsibility. | | |
|--|--|--|
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| The SAR DT determined that a RC maintaining Reliable Operations requires staffing 24/7; which is inherent in an RC fulfilling the compliance obligations for requirements identified on pages 3, 4 and 5 of the SAR. With regards to your comment concerning adequately trained personnel, training requirements are stated in PER-005. | | |
| | Pool, Inc. (RTO) - 2 - SPP RE, Group Name SPP Standards Review Group | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| We would like to thank the drafting team for their efforts of pointing out the redundancy associated with this standard. | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| Thank you for your affirmative response and clarifying comment. | | |
| Dana Klem - Midwest Reliability Organization - 1,2,3,4,5,6 - MRO, Group Name MRO NSRF | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |



| The NSRF agrees with the PRT recommendation for retirement of PER-004-2. | |
|--|--|
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| Thank you for your affirmative response | e and clarifying comment. |
| Richard Vine - California ISO - 2, Group | Name ISO/RTO Council Standards Review Committee |
| Answer | Yes |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| No comment | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| Ginette Lacasse - Seattle City Light - 1,3 | 3,4,5,6 - WECC, Group Name Seattle City Light Ballot Body |
| Answer | Yes |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| No Comments | |
| Likes 0 | |



| Dislikes 0 | | |
|---|--|--|
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Elizabeth Axson - Electric Reliability Co | Elizabeth Axson - Electric Reliability Council of Texas, Inc 2 | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| John Merrell - Tacoma Public Utilities (Tacoma, WA) - 1,3,4,5,6 | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Brian Van Gheem - ACES Power Marketing - 6 - NA - Not Applicable, Group Name ACES Standards Collaborators | | |
| Answer | Yes | |



| Document Name | | |
|--|--|--|
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Ruida Shu - Northeast Power Coordina | ting Council - 1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10 - NPCC, Group Name RSC | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Colby Bellville - Duke Energy - 1,3,5,6 - FRCC,SERC,RF, Group Name Duke Energy | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |



| Response | | |
|---|---|--|
| | | |
| Karie Barczak - DTE Energy - Detroit Ed | lison Company - 3,4,5, Group Name DTE Energy - DTE Electric | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Michael Cruz-Montes - CenterPoint En | ergy Houston Electric, LLC - 1 - Texas RE | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| sean erickson - Western Area Power Administration - 1,6 | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |



| Comment | |
|--|--|
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| 5,6 - MRO,WECC,SPP RE | |
| Yes | |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| Laura Nelson - IDACORP - Idaho Power Company - 1 | |
| Yes | |
| | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| Response | |
| | |



| Southern Company Services, Inc 1,3,5,6 - SERC, Group Name Southern Company | | |
|--|--|--|
| Yes | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| Lauren Price - American Transmission Company, LLC - 1 | | |
| Yes | | |
| | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Leonard Kula - Independent Electricity System Operator - 2 | | |
| Yes | | |
| | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |



| Likes 0 | |
|--|--------------------------------|
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| Kristine Ward - Seminole Electric Coop | erative, Inc 1,3,4,5,6 - FRCC |
| Answer | Yes |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| John Williams - Tallahassee Electric (Ci | ty of Tallahassee, FL) - 1,3,5 |
| Answer | Yes |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| · | |



| Document Name Comment Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Alex Ybarra - Public Utility District No. 2 of Grant County, Washington - 1,4,5,6 Answer Yes Document Name Comment Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | LeRoy Patterson - Public Utility District No. 2 of Grant County, Washington - 1,4,5,6 | | |
|--|---|---|--|
| Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Alex Ybarra - Public Utility District No. 2 of Grant County, Washington - 1,4,5,6 Answer Yes Document Name Comment Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | Answer | Yes | |
| Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Alex Ybarra - Public Utility District No. 2 of Grant County, Washington - 1,4,5,6 Answer Yes Document Name Comment Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | Document Name | | |
| Dislikes 0 Response Alex Ybarra - Public Utility District No. 2 of Grant County, Washington - 1,4,5,6 Answer Yes Document Name Comment Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | Comment | | |
| Dislikes 0 Response Alex Ybarra - Public Utility District No. 2 of Grant County, Washington - 1,4,5,6 Answer Yes Document Name Comment Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | | | |
| Alex Ybarra - Public Utility District No. 2 of Grant County, Washington - 1,4,5,6 Answer Document Name Comment Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | Likes 0 | | |
| Alex Ybarra - Public Utility District No. 2 of Grant County, Washington - 1,4,5,6 Answer Yes Document Name Comment Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | Dislikes 0 | | |
| Answer Yes Document Name Comment Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | Response | | |
| Answer Yes Document Name Comment Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | | | |
| Comment Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | Alex Ybarra - Public Utility District No. | 2 of Grant County, Washington - 1,4,5,6 | |
| Comment Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | Answer | Yes | |
| Likes 0 Dislikes 0 Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | Document Name | | |
| Dislikes 0 Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | Comment | | |
| Dislikes 0 Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | | | |
| Response Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | Likes 0 | | |
| Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 Answer | Dislikes 0 | | |
| Answer | Response | | |
| Answer | | | |
| | Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 | | |
| Document Name | Answer | | |
| | Document Name | | |
| Comment | Comment | | |



| This Standard is not applicable to Manitoba Hydro. | | |
|--|------------|--|
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| Thank you for your clarifying comment. | | |
| Jamie Monette - Allete - Minnesota Po | wer, Inc 1 | |
| Answer | | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| We are not an RC. | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| Thank you for your clarifying comment. | | |
| Aaron Cavanaugh - Bonneville Power Administration - 1,3,5,6 - WECC | | |
| Answer | | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| PER-004-2 does not apply to BPA as BPA is not registered as a Reliability Coordinator. | | |
| Likes 0 | | |



Dislikes 0

Response

Thank you for your clarifying comment.



| 3. Do you know of any additional requirements that the PRT has not identified to justify the retirement of PER-004-2? If yes, please identify the standard and requirement in the comment area below. | | |
|---|---|--|
| Richard Vine - California ISO - 2, Group | Name ISO/RTO Council Standards Review Committee | |
| Answer | No | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| No comment | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Alex Ybarra - Public Utility District No. | 2 of Grant County, Washington - 1,4,5,6 | |
| Answer | No | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| LeRoy Patterson - Public Utility District No. 2 of Grant County, Washington - 1,4,5,6 | | |



| Answer | No |
|--|----|
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| John Williams - Tallahassee Electric (City of Tallahassee, FL) - 1,3,5 | |
| Answer | No |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| Kristine Ward - Seminole Electric Cooperative, Inc 1,3,4,5,6 - FRCC | |
| Answer | No |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| | |



| Dislikes 0 | | | |
|---|---|--|--|
| Response | | | |
| | | | |
| Leonard Kula - Independent Electricity | y System Operator - 2 | | |
| Answer | No | | |
| Document Name | | | |
| Comment | | | |
| | | | |
| Likes 0 | | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | | |
| Response | | | |
| | | | |
| Lauren Price - American Transmission | Lauren Price - American Transmission Company, LLC - 1 | | |
| Answer | No | | |
| Document Name | | | |
| Comment | | | |
| | | | |
| Likes 0 | | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | | |
| Response | | | |
| | | | |
| Marsha Morgan - Southern Company - Southern Company Services, Inc 1,3,5,6 - SERC, Group Name Southern Company | | | |
| Answer | No | | |
| | | | |



| Document Name | |
|---|-------------|
| Comment | |
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| Laura Nelson - IDACORP - Idaho Power | Company - 1 |
| Answer | No |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| Amy Casuscelli - Xcel Energy, Inc 1,3,5,6 - MRO,WECC,SPP RE | |
| Answer | No |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |



| Response | | |
|---|---|--|
| | | |
| sean erickson - Western Area Power A | dministration - 1,6 | |
| Answer | No | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Michael Cruz-Montes - CenterPoint En | ergy Houston Electric, LLC - 1 - Texas RE | |
| Answer | No | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Dana Klem - Midwest Reliability Organization - 1,2,3,4,5,6 - MRO, Group Name MRO NSRF | | |
| Answer | No | |
| Document Name | | |
| | | |



| Comment | |
|---|--|
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| Karie Barczak - DTE Energy - Detroit Ed | ison Company - 3,4,5, Group Name DTE Energy - DTE Electric |
| Answer | No |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |
| | |
| Rachel Coyne - Texas Reliability Entity, Inc 10 | |
| Answer | No |
| Document Name | |
| Comment | |
| | |
| Likes 0 | |
| Dislikes 0 | |
| Response | |



| FRCC,SERC,RF, Group Name Duke Energy | | |
|--|--|--|
| No | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| ting Council - 1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10 - NPCC, Group Name RSC | | |
| No | | |
| | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Shannon Mickens - Southwest Power Pool, Inc. (RTO) - 2 - SPP RE, Group Name SPP Standards Review Group | | |
| No | | |
| | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |



| Likes 0 | | | |
|---|----|--|--|
| Dislikes 0 | | | |
| Response | | | |
| | | | |
| Brian Van Gheem - ACES Power Marketing - 6 - NA - Not Applicable, Group Name ACES Standards Collaborators | | | |
| Answer | No | | |
| Document Name | | | |
| Comment | | | |
| | | | |
| Likes 0 | | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | | |
| Response | | | |
| | | | |
| John Merrell - Tacoma Public Utilities (Tacoma, WA) - 1,3,4,5,6 | | | |
| Answer | No | | |
| Document Name | | | |
| Comment | | | |
| | | | |
| Likes 0 | | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | | |
| Response | | | |
| _ | | | |
| | | | |



| Elizabeth Axson - Electric Reliability Council of Texas, Inc 2 | | |
|--|-----|--|
| Answer | No | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Ginette Lacasse - Seattle City Light - 1,3,4,5,6 - WECC, Group Name Seattle City Light Ballot Body | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| No Comments | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Stephanie Burns - International Transmission Company Holdings Corporation - 1 - MRO,SPP RE,RF | | |
| Answer | Yes | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| | | |



| Likes 0 | | |
|--|--|--|
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| | | |
| Aaron Cavanaugh - Bonneville Power Administration - 1,3,5,6 - WECC | | |
| Answer | | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| PER-004-2 does not apply to BPA as BPA is not registered as a Reliability Coordinator. | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| Thank you for your clarifying comment. | | |
| Jamie Monette - Allete - Minnesota Power, Inc 1 | | |
| Answer | | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| We are not an RC. | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| | | |



| Response | | |
|--|--|--|
| | | |
| Mike Smith - Manitoba Hydro - 1,3,5,6 | | |
| Answer | | |
| Document Name | | |
| Comment | | |
| This Standard is not applicable to Manitoba Hydro. | | |
| Likes 0 | | |
| Dislikes 0 | | |
| Response | | |
| Thank you for your clarifying comment. | | |

End of Report