Review of MOD-004-1—Capacity Benefit Margin (Deferred)

http://www.nerc.com/files/MOD-004-1.pdf

VRFs for Requirements R3 and R4:

Standard,	Requirement Language	VRF Assignment	Guideline Explanations from	Comments
Requirement			December 1, 2010 MOD VRF	
			and VSL Compliance Filing.	
MOD-004-1, R3	Each Load-Serving Entity	Lower Medium	Requirement R3 of MOD-004-1	In a December 1, 2010 filing, NERC
	determining the need for		requires that an Load Serving	proposed changing the R1 VRF
	Transmission capacity to		Entity that is defining the need	assignment from a Lower to a
	be set aside as CBM for		for CBM define that need using	Medium. Citing Guideline 2, FERC
	imports into a Balancing		Loss of Load Expectation	expressed concern that MOD-004-
	Authority Area shall		("LOLE") studies and/or Loss of	1's VRF assignment was inconsistent
	determine that need by:		Load Probability ("LOLP")	with MOD-004-1 R1. FERC believes
			studies and/or deterministic	that R3 and R4 should have been
	R3.1. Using one or more of		risk-analysis and/or reserve	similarly changed.
	the following to determine		margin or resource adequacy	
	the GCIR:		requirements established by	NERC staff agrees with FERC staff's
			other entities. The Load Serving	concerns. If "The procedure for a
	Loss of Load Expectation		Entity must also identify any	Load-Serving Entity or Balancing
	(LOLE) studies		expected import paths or	Authority to use Transmission
			source regions. NERC	capacity set aside as CBM" (R1.3) is a
	Loss of Load Probability		stakeholders developed and	Medium, then R3, which establishes
	(LOLP) studies		balloted this requirement with	how the LSE is to determine its CMB
			a "Lower" VRF assignment.	need, should also be Medium based
	Deterministic risk-analysis		NERC agrees that the VRF	on Guideline 2.
	studies		assignment for this	
			requirement should be	
	Reserve margin or		"Lower." Complying with this	
	resource adequacy		requirement will aid in the	
	requirements established		establishment of an	
	by other entities, such as		appropriate CBM, but it is not	

	municipalities, state commissions, regional transmission organizations, independent system operators, Regional Reliability Organizations, or regional entities R3.2. Identifying expected import path(s) or source region(s).		the only source of information from which the appropriate level of CBM may be derived. Additionally, entities are not required to use CBM. Accordingly, it does not meet the criteria for "Medium" or "High" risk factor assignment.	
MOD-004-1, R4	Each Resource Planner determining the need for Transmission capacity to be set aside as CBM for imports into a Balancing Authority Area shall determine that need by: R4.1. Using one or more of the following to determine the GCIR: Loss of Load Expectation (LOLE) studies Loss of Load Probability (LOLP) studies Deterministic risk-analysis studies	<u>LowerMedium</u>	Requirement R4 of MOD-004-1 requires that a Resource Planner that is defining the need for CBM define that need using LOLE studies and/or LOLP studies and/or deterministic risk-analysis and/or reserve margin or resource adequacy requirements established by other entities. The Resource Planner must also identify any expected import paths or source regions. NERC stakeholders developed and balloted this requirement with a "Lower" VRF assignment. NERC agrees that the VRF assignment for this requirement should be "Lower." Complying with this requirement will aid in the	In a December 1, 2010 filing, NERC proposed changing the R1 VRF assignment from a Lower to a Medium. Citing Guideline 2, FERC expressed concern that MOD-004-1's VRF assignment was inconsistent with MOD-004-1 R1. FERC believes that R3 and R4 should have been similarly changed. NERC staff agrees with FERC staff's concerns. If "The process through which a Load-Serving Entity within a Balancing Authority Area associated with the Transmission Service Provider, or the Resource Planner associated with that Balancing Authority Area, may ensure that its need for Transmission capacity to be set aside as CBM will be reviewed and accommodated by the
	Reserve margin or resource adequacy		establishment of an appropriate CBM, but it is not	Transmission Service Provider to the extent Transmission capacity is

requirements established by other entities, such as municipalities, state commissions, regional transmission organizations, independent system	the only source of information from which the appropriate level of CBM may be derived. Additionally, entities are not required to use CBM. Accordingly, it does not meet	available" (R1.1) is a Medium, then R4, which establishes how the Resource Planner is to determine its CMB need, should also be Medium based on Guideline 2.
operators, Regional	the criteria for "Medium" or	
Reliability Organizations, or regional entities	"High" risk factor assignment.	
R4.2. Identifying expected import path(s) or source region(s).		

For additional background information, please see the notes that NERC used to justify R1's switch from a Lower VRF to a Medium VRF:

Requirement R1 of MOD-004-1 requires that a Transmission Service Provider that has elected to maintain CBM must create and keep current a "CBM Implementation Document ("CBMID")" that includes details on how to request CBM, how CBM is established, how CBM is used, and how conflicting needs for CBM are addressed. NERC stakeholders developed and balloted this requirement with a "Lower" VRF assignment. This requirement specifies the creation of rules and processes that are used to determine CBM. If these processes are not developed, it is possible that an appropriate amount of CBM will not be withheld. Since Requirements R11 and R12, which define the use of CBM, are assigned a VRF of "Medium," Commission VRF Guideline 2 dictates that Requirement R1 should also be assigned a VRF of "Medium." On this basis, NERC believes that the VRF assignment for this requirement should be "Medium." NAESB standards, not NERC standards, will be addressing the public disclosure of this information.